



RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

R. KEVIN CLINTON
STATE TREASURER

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

***Holiday Inn Express and Okemos Conference Center,
Okemos A & B Rooms
2187 University Park Drive, Okemos, Michigan***

***Monday, February 10, 2014
9:00 a.m.***

***PRESENT: Douglas B. Roberts, Chair STC
Robert H. Naftaly, Member STC
Barry S. Simon, Member STC***

***Kelli Sobel, Executive Director
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary***

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of December 16, 2013. (Item 1 on agenda)

Executive Director Sobel stated: I would like to let everyone know why we have changed the location of the Commission Meetings. We were previously meeting at the Lansing Center because of the security in our building and the difficulty to get individuals in and out of our building. The Lansing Center worked well for us; however, they could not commit to future space for us. Being a public body and public meetings the Commission cannot be in the situation where at the last minute the meeting location is cancelled. The Holiday Inn and Okemos Conference Center has been gracious enough to give us a three year commitment so that is why we are meeting at this location.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Executive Director Sobel's recommendation regarding State Assessed Telephone Companies to continue the 10% obsolescence factor on personal property and provide 20% obsolescence for copper for the 2014 year. The Commission also approved to ask staff to convene a work group with the major companies to discuss and review the personal property tables and make possible changes for the 2015 year. (Item 2 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the 2013 State Tax Commission Annual Report submitted by Executive Director Sobel. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to overturn the actions of the Empire Township, Leelanau County Board of Review related to parcel 45-005-005-02-00. (Item 4 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 1 of 2014 Certified Interest Rates. (Item 5 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 2 of 2014 Property Inspection. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 7 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on **May 1, 2017**.

New Certifications:

Monroe County

LaSalle Township
London Township
Milan Township
City of Monroe

Recertifications

Iron County

City of Caspian

Jackson County

Summit Township
Tompkins Township

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Special Exemptions Agenda. (Item 8 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Exemptions Agenda. (Item 9 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (Item 10 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt staff recommendations on the MCL 211.154 **Special Items Agenda** except for the following. The Commission approved to not dismiss petitions 154-12-1498, 154-12-1499, and 154-22-1500. The Commission also approved to postpone petition 154-12-0325 until April 8, 2014. (Item 11 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petition until **April 8, 2014**. (Item 12 on agenda)

Kimball Township, St. Clair County

154-13-0965 WILLIAM F. DELAND JR.; 74-25-999-0016-178; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 0	to \$ 18,000	TV from \$ 0	to \$ 18,000
2012 AV from \$ 0	to \$ 17,000	TV from \$ 0	to \$ 17,000
2013 AV from \$ 15,000	to \$ 16,000	TV from \$ 15,000	to \$ 16,000

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **amend** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 12 on agenda)

City of Auburn Hills, Oakland County

154-13-0962 YOUR SOURCE MANAGEMENT; 02-99-00-002-148; Personal Property

****This was also a concurrence.**

2011 AV from \$ 19,540	to \$ 28,690	TV from \$ 19,540	to \$ 28,690
2012 AV from \$ 20,070	to \$ 25,030	TV from \$ 20,070	to \$ 25,030
2013 AV from \$ 20,550	to \$ 22,240	TV from \$ 20,550	to \$ 22,240

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **deny** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 12 on agenda)

Independence Township, Oakland County

154-13-0787 AMERICAN CONSOLIDATED TECH LLC; J-99-10-677-080; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 1,145,500	to \$ 862,700	TV from \$ 1,145,500	to \$ 862,700
2012 AV from \$ 992,200	to \$ 745,600	TV from \$ 992,200	to \$ 745,600
2013 AV from \$ 879,600	to \$ 660,700	TV from \$ 879,600	to \$ 660,700

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to allow the **withdrawal** of the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 12 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences**, initially noticed as non-concurrences. (Item 12 on agenda)

Coldwater Township, Branch County

154-13-0943 DOUGLAS & JANEIL TRAIL; 12-070-009-100-005-06; REAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 8,400 to \$ 21,900 TV from \$ 2,116 to \$ 5,001
2012 AV from \$ 8,400 to \$ 21,900 TV from \$ 2,173 to \$ 5,136
2013 AV from \$ 8,400 to \$ 21,900 TV from \$ 2,225 to \$ 5,259

City of Auburn Hills, Oakland County

154-13-0948 TOYOTA MOTOR CREDIT CORPORATION; 02-99-00-097-285; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 45,570 to \$ 56,750 TV from \$ 45,570 to \$ 56,750

154-13-0949 IBC PRECISION INC.; 02-99-00-013-167; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 100,060 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 100,060

154-13-0963 SBS CORPORATION; 02-99-00-009-033; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 48,310 to \$ 85,770 TV from \$ 48,310 to \$ 85,770
2012 AV from \$ 78,510 to \$ 109,990 TV from \$ 78,510 to \$ 109,990
2013 AV from \$ 80,040 to \$ 105,790 TV from \$ 80,040 to \$ 105,790

City of Madison Heights, Oakland County

154-13-0951 FCS AUTOMOTIVE INTERNATIONAL INC; 44-99-00-013-078; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 14,840 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 14,840

City of Detroit, Wayne County

154-13-0958 GREEKTOWN CASINO LLC; 03000229-37; REAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 1,427,430 to \$ 4,199,111 TV from \$ 1,177,600 to \$ 3,485,262

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions. ([See attached link for file identification.](#)) (Item 12 on agenda)

Public Comment (Item 13 on agenda): No member of the public wished to comment.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, to go into closed session to discuss pending litigation. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioner Naftaly – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioners Naftaly – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to authorize staff to approve the settlement with TDS and work out the final details to resolve the case.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to resolve the open Marathon classification court cases 09-1381, 10-1381, 10-1474 and 10-1476 that have been held in abeyance since 2009 and 2010 and classify those parcels as Industrial.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to not appeal the General Motors case to the Supreme Court.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to ask the Supreme Court for reconsideration on their denial to accept the Cummins Bridgeway, Target, and Cintas cases.

The State Tax Commission was provided with the results of the record card review for the City of Detroit. While the review showed that the record cards for the City are generally accurate in their listing of the properties attributes, the record cards themselves showed serious deficiencies. Specifically, all of the cards reviewed were in override, the majority of the homes were at a class C, all homes were at 45% depreciation, all had an ECF of 1.0 and land values are all flat valued. It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to ask the City of Detroit to submit a corrective action plan with detailed information on how they will correct the deficiencies and a timetable for those corrections.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to receive the request from Enbridge Energy Company regarding their decommissioned 6b pipeline. The Commission approved to notify assessors that for 2014, the 65 miles of decommissioned line that has been replaced may be removed from the assessment roll and the remaining line that will be replaced during 2014 can be removed from the assessment roll in 2015.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the Equalization Study Guidelines from the Assessment and Certification Division for the 2014 year.

It was brought to the Commission's attention that Chesterfield Township is denying the ability for disabled veterans to apply for the 2013 Veteran's Exemption with the July 2014 Board of Review because they disagree with the Commission's determination. It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to notify the local unit in very strong terms that they are not entitled to a separate opinion different from that of the Commission and if the assessor continues to deny the right for the disabled veterans to apply to the July 2013 Board of Review they will be asked to appear before the Assessor Discipline Advisory Committee.

Chairman Roberts asked the Commission to possibly look at changing the October 28th meeting date.

The next Commission meeting will be held April 8, 2014 at the Holiday Inn Express in the Stadium Room, 2187 University Park Drive, Okemos.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 10:40 a.m.

DATE TYPED: February 11, 2014

DATE APPROVED: April 8, 2014

**Douglas B. Roberts, Chair
State Tax Commission**

**Robert H. Naftaly, Member
State Tax Commission**

**Barry N. Simon, Member
State Tax Commission**